

CONSTITUTION-MAKING AND TRANSNATIONAL LEGAL ORDER

Since the rise of the nation-state in the nineteenth century, constitutions have been seen as an embodiment of national values and identity. However, individuals, ideas, and institutions from abroad have always influenced constitutions, and so the process is better described as transnational. As cross-border interaction is increasing in intensity, a dominant transnational legal order for constitutions has emerged, with its own norms, guidelines, and shared ideas. Yet both the process and substance of constitution-making are being contested in divergent and insurgent constitutional orders. Bringing together leading scholars from the United States, Europe, Latin America, and Asia, this volume addresses the actors, networks, norms, and processes involved in constitution making, as well as the related challenges, from a transnational and comparative perspective. Drawing from the research on transnational legal orders, this work explores and examines constitution-making in every region of the world.

Gregory Shaffer is Chancellor's Professor of Law, University of California, Irvine School of Law.

Tom Ginsburg is Leo Spitz Professor of International Law at the University of Chicago Law School and a Research Professor at the American Bar Foundation.

Terence C. Halliday is a Research Professor at the American Bar Foundation.

COMPARATIVE CONSTITUTIONAL LAW AND POLICY

Series Editors

Tom Ginsburg *University of Chicago*
 Zachary Elkins *University of Texas at Austin*
 Ran Hirschl *University of Toronto*

Comparative constitutional law is an intellectually vibrant field that encompasses an increasingly broad array of approaches and methodologies. This series collects analytically innovative and empirically grounded work from scholars of comparative constitutionalism across academic disciplines. Books in the series include theoretically informed studies of single constitutional jurisdictions, comparative studies of constitutional law and institutions, and edited collections of original essays that respond to challenging theoretical and empirical questions in the field.

Books in the Series

- Hybrid Constitutionalism* Eric C. Ip
The Politico-Legal Dynamics of Judicial Review Thenuis Roux
The Invisible Constitution in Comparative Perspective Edited by Rosalind Dixon and Adrienne Stone
Constitutional Courts in Asia: A Comparative Perspective Edited by Albert H. Y. Chen and Andrew Harding
Judicial Review in Norway Anine Kierulf
Constituent Assemblies Edited by Jon Elster, Roberto Gargarella, Vatsal Naresh, and Bjorn Erik Rasch
The DNA of Constitutional Justice in Latin America: Politics, Governance, and Judicial Design Daniel M. Brinks and Abby Blass
The Adventures of the Constituent Power: Beyond Revolutions? Andrew Arato
Constitutions, Religion and Politics in Asia: Indonesia, Malaysia and Sri Lanka Dian A. H. Shah
Canada in the World: Comparative Perspectives on the Canadian Constitution Edited by Richard Albert and David R. Cameron
Courts and Democracies in Asia Po Jen Yap
Proportionality: New Frontiers, New Challenges Edited by Vicki C. Jackson and Mark Tushnet
Constituents before Assembly: Participation, Deliberation, and Representation in the Crafting of New Constitutions Todd A. Eisenstadt, A. Carl LeVan, and Tofiq Maboudi
Assessing Constitutional Performance Edited by Tom Ginsburg and Aziz Huq
Buddhism, Politics and the Limits of Law: The Pyrrhic Constitutionalism of Sri Lanka Benjamin Schonthal
Engaging with Social Rights: Procedure, Participation and Democracy in South Africa's Second Wave Brian Ray
Constitutional Courts as Mediators: Armed Conflict, Civil–Military Relations, and the Rule of Law in Latin America Julio Ríos-Figueroa

- Perils of Judicial Self-Government in Transitional Societies* David Kosař
- Making We the People: Democratic Constitutional Founding in Postwar Japan and South Korea* Chaihark Hahm and Sung Ho Kim
- Radical Deprivation on Trial: The Impact of Judicial Activism on Socioeconomic Rights in the Global South* César Rodríguez-Garavito and Diana Rodríguez-Franco
- Unstable Constitutionalism: Law and Politics in South Asia* Edited by Mark Tushnet and Madhav Khosla
- Magna Carta and Its Modern Legacy* Edited by Robert Hazell and James Melton
- Constitutions and Religious Freedom* Frank B. Cross
- International Courts and the Performance of International Agreements: A General Theory with Evidence from the European Union* Clifford J. Carrubba and Matthew J. Gabel
- Reputation and Judicial Tactics: A Theory of National and International Courts* Shai Dothan
- Social Difference and Constitutionalism in Pan-Asia* Edited by Susan H. Williams
- Constitutionalism in Asia in the Early Twenty-First Century* Edited by Albert H. Y. Chen
- Constitutions in Authoritarian Regimes* Edited by Tom Ginsburg and Alberto Simpser
- Presidential Legislation in India: The Law and Practice of Ordinances* Shubhankar Dam
- Social and Political Foundations of Constitutions* Edited by Denis J. Galligan and Mila Versteeg
- Consequential Courts: Judicial Roles in Global Perspective* Edited by Diana Kapiszewski, Gordon Silverstein, and Robert A. Kagan
- Comparative Constitutional Design* Edited by Tom Ginsburg

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47310-1 — Constitution-Making and Transnational Legal Order
Edited by Gregory Shaffer , Tom Ginsburg , Terence C. Halliday
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47310-1 — Constitution-Making and Transnational Legal Order
Edited by Gregory Shaffer , Tom Ginsburg , Terence C. Halliday
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Constitution-Making and Transnational Legal Order

Edited by

GREGORY SHAFFER

University of California, Irvine

TOM GINSBURG

University of Chicago

TERENCE C. HALLIDAY

American Bar Foundation



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47310-1 — Constitution-Making and Transnational Legal Order
Edited by Gregory Shaffer, Tom Ginsburg, Terence C. Halliday
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108473101

DOI: 10.1017/9781108561792

© Cambridge University Press 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-47310-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47310-1 — Constitution-Making and Transnational Legal Order
Edited by Gregory Shaffer , Tom Ginsburg , Terence C. Halliday
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

To Brooks and Sage

GS

To the memory of the Martman

TC

To Felix

TH

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47310-1 — Constitution-Making and Transnational Legal Order
Edited by Gregory Shaffer , Tom Ginsburg , Terence C. Halliday
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	page xi
<i>List of Tables</i>	xii
<i>List of Contributors</i>	xiii
1. Constitution-Making as Transnational Legal Ordering <i>Tom Ginsburg, Terence C. Halliday, and Gregory Shaffer</i>	1
2. Constitutional Advice and Transnational Legal Order <i>Tom Ginsburg</i>	26
3. A Transnational Actor on a Dramatic Stage – Sir Ivor Jennings and the Manipulation of Westminster Style Democracy in Pakistan <i>H. Kumarasingham</i>	55
4. Constitutions in World Society: A New Measure of Human Rights <i>Colin J. Beck, John W. Meyer, Ralph I. Hosoki, and Gili S. Drori</i>	85
5. Constitutional Dialects: The Language of Transnational Legal Orders <i>David S. Law</i>	110
6. Transnational Constitution-Making: The Contribution of the Venice Commission on Law and Democracy <i>Paul Craig</i>	156
7. Autocracy under Cover of the Transnational Legal Order <i>Kim Lane Scheppele</i>	188
8. Democratic Erosion and Constitution-Making Moments: The Role of Transnational Legal Norms <i>David E. Landau</i>	234

9.	The Possibilities and Limits of a Constitution-Making Transnational Legal Order: The Case of Chile	265
	<i>Javier Couso</i>	
10.	Participatory Constitution-Making as a Transnational Legal Norm: Why Does It “Stick” in Some Contexts and Not in Others?	283
	<i>Abrak Saati</i>	
	<i>Index</i>	312

Figures

4.1	Average Human Rights in Constitutions by Year	<i>page</i> 95
4.2	Geography of UDHR Scale in 2013	96
4.3	UDHR Scale and Year of Constitution	99
4.4	UDHR Scale and Human Rights Regime	100
4.5	Rights Discourse and Year of Constitution	102
4.6	Rights Discourse and Human Rights Regime in Year Written	102
5.1	Topic Correlation Plot (K = 7)	127
5.2	Topic Correlation Plot (K = 30)	128
5.3	High-Frequency Words Associated with “Francophonie” Topic (K = 30)	130
5.4	High-Frequency Words Associated with “Parliament and Judiciary” Topic (K = 7)	131
5.5	High-Frequency Words Associated with “Commonwealth” Topic (K = 7)	131
5.6	High-Frequency Words Associated with “Latin America” Topic (K = 7)	138
5.7	High-Frequency Words Associated with “Socialism” Topic (K = 7)	139
5.8	Average Prevalence in New Constitutions of “Socialism” and “Central and Eastern Europe” Topics (K = 7)	141
5.9	Average Prevalence in New Constitutions of “Commonwealth” and “Judiciary” Topics (K = 7)	142
5.10	Average Prevalence in New Constitutions of “Latin America,” “Federalism,” and “Monarchy” Topics (K = 7)	143
5.11	Average Prevalence in New Constitutions of “Latin America,” “Legal System,” and “Foreign Affairs” Topics (K = 30)	144

Tables

4.1	CCP Variables and UDHR Coverage	<i>page</i> 93
4.2	Top and Bottom Ten Countries by UDHR Scale, 2013	97
4.3	Descriptive Statistics of Variables Used in Analysis, 2005	98
4.4	Results of Multivariate Regression of Rights Measure, 2005	101
5.1	Keywords and Topic Labels (K = 7)	119
5.2	Topic Labels (K = 30)	121
5.3	Average Prevalence of All Topics in the K = 7 Model	125
5.4	Average Prevalence of All Topics in the K = 30 Model	126
5.5	Constitutions Containing the Highest Proportion of “Francophonie” Topic (K = 30)	129
5.6	Constitutions Containing the Highest Proportion of Commonwealth-Related Topics (K = 7)	132
5.7	Constitutions Containing the Highest Proportion of Commonwealth-Related Topics (K = 30)	133
5.8	Constitutions Containing the Highest Proportion of “Latin America” Topic (K = 7)	135
5.9	Constitutions Containing the Highest Proportion of Spanish Colonial Topics (K = 30)	137
5.10	Constitutions Containing the Highest Proportion of “Socialism” Topic (K = 7)	140
5.11	Constitutions Containing the Highest Proportion of “Socialism” and “Communism” Topics (K = 30)	140

Contributors

COLIN J. BECK is Associate Professor of Sociology and the Chair of Sociology at Pomona College.

JAVIER COUSO is Professor of Law at the Universidad Diego Portales in Chile.

PAUL CRAIG is Professor of English Law at Oxford University.

GILI S. DRORI is Associate Professor of Sociology and Anthropology at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel.

TOM GINSBURG is Leo Spitz Professor of International Law at the University of Chicago Law School and a Research Professor at the American Bar Foundation.

TERENCE C. HALLIDAY is Research Professor at the American Bar Foundation.

RALPH I. HOSOKI is Assistant Professor, College of International Professional Development, Kansai Gaidai University, Japan.

H. KUMARASINGHAM is Lecturer in Politics at the University of Edinburgh.

DAVID E. LANDAU is Mason Ladd Professor and Associate Dean for International Programs at Florida State University College of Law.

DAVID S. LAW is Charles Nagel Chair in Constitutional Law and Political Science at Washington University in St. Louis and Sir Y.K. Pao Chair in Public Law at the University of Hong Kong.

JOHN W. MEYER is Professor of Sociology at Stanford University.

ABRAK SAATI is Senior Researcher at the Department of Political Science at Umea University.

KIM LANE SCHEPPELE is Laurence S. Rockefeller Professor of Sociology and International Affairs in the Woodrow Wilson School and the University Center for Human Values at Princeton University.

GREGORY SHAFFER is Chancellor's Professor at the University of California, Irvine School of Law.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47310-1 — Constitution-Making and Transnational Legal Order
Edited by Gregory Shaffer , Tom Ginsburg , Terence C. Halliday
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)
